

Pardes Rodef Shalom Schools Program

A Taste of *Tochacha* Teacher's Guide



Revised: November 2016



The [Pardes Rodef Shalom Schools Program](#) is a joint venture of the **Pardes Center for Jewish Educators** and the **Pardes Center for Judaism and Conflict Resolution**.

© 2016 Pardes Institute of Jewish Studies. All Rights Reserved.

באמצעות פנייתנו אל מנהל המערכת
במסגרת תוכנית פארדס רודף שלום
האנו מודים לך על שיתוף הפעולה
בפרוייקט זה



A Taste of *Tochacha*

Lesson Goals:

Students will...

- Learn the basic vocabulary and concepts that relate to *tochacha*.
- Understand how Vayikra 19:17 serves as the source for *tochacha* and constructive communication.
- Define “constructive communication.”
- Appreciate that discussing issues that come up with our friends, neighbors and family can be absolutely essential for maintaining peaceful and loving relationships.

Today's Question/s (recommended for the board):

- What are some possible ways to communicate with a person who has upset you?
- Can you have a good relationship with someone if you don't tell them when they upset you?

Optional Starter Activity/ies:

1. Have students discuss the question about different ways to communicate. Guide them towards thinking about which ways are most likely to lead to a constructive resolution of the conflict.
2. Define *tochacha* as both rebuke and reproof (or have students define these words). Have students consider what the differences are between these two types of *tochacha*. Ask them to suggest examples of how *tochacha* could be negative and destructive.

Students engage in text study:

At this point students can engage with the provided texts (see the Student *Havruta* Handout) in whatever way (or combination of ways) that the teacher deems most appropriate based on the timing of the lesson, level of the students and nature of the content. Students can study: independently, in pairs, small groups, or as a class (the teacher might consider giving the students a choice of their preferred method). The number of texts here might be too much for a single class/*havruta* session. Consider breaking up the time and task, running this lesson over two class periods or days, or learn/teach some of the texts as a class instead of in *havruta*.



Suggested Activities and/or Assessments for the close of the lesson:

1. Short essay reflection: Does constructive *tochacha* always lead to love and peace?
 - Come up with one real-life type of example, or case, that illustrates how discussing an interpersonal issue “leads to love,” while without doing so, there would not be “[true] love.”
 - Come up with one real-life type of example, or case, that illustrates how discussing an interpersonal issue “leads to peace,” while without doing so, there would not be “[true] peace.”
2. Re-write a ‘destructive communication’ scene:
 - Have students think of a scene from a book, movie or TV show that depicts destructive conflict/conversation.
 - Students must then describe why the interaction between the characters was destructive.
 - Finally, have students re-write the scene, such that one of the characters reproves the other in the spirit of the Ramban or Bechor Shor’s depiction of *tochacha*.
3. Students can create, draw or find visual representations of constructive and destructive *tochacha*.
4. Ask students to journal about a time when they used constructive or destructive communication to resolve an issue with someone, or when someone used constructive or destructive communication with them. What happened as a result?

Optional additional sources:

<p>Abraham Ibn Ezra, Leviticus 19:17 “Rebuke” – Perhaps you will suspect him for a matter and it was not [as you think], and this is the reason “and do not incur guilt because of him” because [if you did not rebuke him] you will be [worthy of being] punished as a result [of what you wrongly do or think] of him.</p>	<p>אבן עזרא, ויקרא יט:יז "הוכח תוכיח" – שמא תחשדהו בדבר ולא היה כן, וזה טעם ולא תשא עליו חטא, כי עונש יהיה לך בעבורו.</p>
<p>Rashbam, Leviticus 19:17 (Rabbi Shmuel Ben Meir, France, 1085-1158) "You shall not hate your kinsfolk in your heart" – Do not hate him in your heart, rather rebuke him on what he did, and from this there will be peace.</p>	<p>רשב"ם ויקרא פרק יט פסוק יז (יז) לא תשנא את אחיך בלבבך – אל תשנאהו בלבך, אלא הוכיח תוכיחהו על מה שעשה ומתוך כך יהיה שלום:</p>

Pardes Rodef Shalom Schools Program

A Taste of *Tochacha* Student *Havruta* Handout



Revised: November 2016



The [Pardes Rodef Shalom Schools Program](#) is a joint venture of the **Pardes Center for Jewish Educators** and the **Pardes Center for Judaism and Conflict Resolution**.

© 2016 Pardes Institute of Jewish Studies. All Rights Reserved.

באגף חינוך
מרכז פארדס
למחקר ולימודים
יהודיים
בירושלים



A Taste of *Tochacha*

The texts and questions below are provided to help you think more about the importance of engaging in constructive conversations.

<p><u>A. Midrash Bereishit Rabbah 54:3</u> Rabbi Yose bar Chanina said: “<i>Tochacha</i> leads to love,” [...] “Any love without <i>tochacha</i> is not [true] love.” Resh Lakish said, “<i>Tochacha</i> leads to peace,” [...] “Any peace without <i>tochacha</i> is not [true] peace.”</p>	<p><u>מדרש, בראשית רבה נד:ג</u> אמר רבי יוסי בר חנינא: התוכחת מביאה לידי אהבה... כל אהבה שאין עמה תוכחה אינה אהבה. אמר ריש לקיש: תוכחה מביאה לידי שלום... כל שלום שאין עמו תוכחה אינו שלום.</p>
--	---

1. Why might R' Yose bar Chanina think that any loving relationship requires *tochacha*? Do you agree?
2. Why might Resh Lakish think that all peace requires *tochacha*? Do you agree?

<p><u>B. Leviticus 19:17</u> You shall not hate your brother in your heart, you shall surely rebuke your friend, and you shall not sin because of him</p>	<p><u>ויקרא יט:יז</u> לֹא־תִשְׂנֵא אֶת־אָחִיךָ בְּלִבְךָ הוֹכַח תּוֹכִיחַ אֶת־עַמִּיתְךָ וְלֹא־תִשָּׂא עָלָיו חַטָּא</p>
---	---

3. What do you think is the connection/s between the three parts of this verse?
4. Why do you think forbidding hatred, offering rebuke and avoiding sin are all included in the same verse?



Here are two possible explanations for the connection between the different parts of this seemingly strange verse :

<p><u>C. Ramban, Leviticus 19:17</u> And the verse said, “You shall not hate your brother in your heart” – when he does something to you against your will, rather rebuke him (saying) ‘why did you do this to me?’ “And do not incur guilt because of him” – to cover up the hatred for him in your heart, and not to tell him, because in your rebuking him, he will apologize to you, or will repent and admit his sin, and be atoned.</p>	<p><u>רמב"ן, ויקרא יט:יז</u> ויאמר הכתוב "לא תשנא את אחיך בלבבך" בעשותו לך שלא כרצונך, אבל תוכיחנו 'מדוע ככה עשית עמדי?' "ולא תשא עליו חטא" – לכסות שנאתו בלבך ולא תגיד לו, כי בהוכיחך אותו יתנצל לך, או ישוב ויתודה חטאו ותכפר לו.</p>
--	--

5. Why, according to Ramban, will rebuking your fellow person prevent you from having hatred in your heart?
6. How is rebuke intended to help your fellow person? What does Ramban say that he/she might do upon hearing your rebuke?

<p><u>D. Rabbi Yosef Bechor Shor, Vayikra 19:17</u> “You shall not hate your brother in your heart” – If your brother does something that upsets you, don’t hate him in your heart. Rather, you should reprove him [that means to say, go over to the person and discuss the matter with him in a respectful manner], and say to him “Why did you do this to me?” Since it is possible that he never intended what you had thought, or he couldn’t help himself, or he will give you some [other] explanation. And through this [by fulfilling the <i>mitzvah</i> of <i>tochacha</i>], you will come to realize that he never did something improper to you. [And in doing so] “You shall not sin because of him” – for having baseless hatred towards him.</p>	<p><u>רבי יוסף בכור שור, ויקרא יט:יז</u> לא-תשנא אֶת-אחיך בלבבך - שאם עשה לך אחיך דבר שקשה בעיניך לא תשנאנו בתוך לבבך. אלא הוכיחנו, ואמר לו "למה עשית לי כזאת?" שמא לא נתכוון למה שאתה סבור או נאנס או שום טעם יש בדבר שיאמר לך, ומתוך כך תדע שלא עשה עמך שלא כהוגן. ולא-תשא עליו חטא - לשנאתו בחנם.</p>
--	--

7. How, according to this second explanation, might *tochacha* help the person who does the rebuking?
8. What is the connection between *tochacha* and not carrying ‘extra’ sin?

Pardes Rodef Shalom Schools Program

A Taste of *Tochacha* Source Sheet



Revised: November 2016



The [Pardes Rodef Shalom Schools Program](#) is a joint venture of the **Pardes Center for Jewish Educators** and the **Pardes Center for Judaism and Conflict Resolution**.

© 2016 Pardes Institute of Jewish Studies. All Rights Reserved.

באנו להעניק לכם את הטעם של השלום



A Taste of *Tochacha*

A. Midrash Bereishit Rabbah 54:3

Rabbi Yose bar Chanina said: "*Tochacha leads to love,*" [...] "Any love without *tochacha* is not [true] love."

Resh Lakish said, "*Tochacha leads to peace,*" [...] "Any peace without *tochacha* is not [true] peace."

מדרש, בראשית רבה נד:ג

אמר רבי יוסי בר חנינא: התוכחת מביאה לידי אהבה... כל אהבה שאין עמה תוכחה אינה אהבה.

אמר ריש לקיש: תוכחה מביאה לידי שלום... כל שלום שאין עמו תוכחה אינו שלום.

B. Leviticus 19:17

You shall not hate your brother in your heart,
you shall surely rebuke your friend,
and you shall not sin because of him.

ויקרא יט:יז

לֹא־תִשְׁנֵא אֶת־אָחִיךָ בְּלִבְךָ
הוֹכַח תּוֹכִיחַ אֶת־עַמִּיתְךָ
וְלֹא־תִשָּׂא עָלָיו חָטָא.

C. Ramban, Leviticus 19:17

And the verse said, "You shall not hate your brother in your heart" – when he does something to you against your will, rather rebuke him (saying) 'why did you do this to me?'
"And do not incur guilt because of him" – to cover up the hatred for him in your heart, and not to tell him, because in your rebuking him, he will apologize to you, or will repent and admit his sin, and be atoned.

רמב"ן, ויקרא יט:יז

ויאמר הכתוב "לא תשנא את אחיך בלבבך" בעשותו לך שלא כרצונך, אבל תוכיחנו 'מדוע ככה עשית עמדי?'
"ולא תשא עליו חטא" – לכסות שנאתו בלבך ולא תגיד לו, כי בהוכיחך אותו יתנצל לך, או ישוב ויתודה חטאו ותכפר לו.



D. Rabbi Yosef Bechor Shor, Vayikra 19:17

“You shall not hate your brother in your heart” – If your brother does something that upsets you, don’t hate him in your heart.

Rather, you should reprove him [that means to say, go over to the person and discuss the matter with him in a respectful manner], and say to him “Why did you do this to me?” Since it is possible that he never intended what you had thought, or he couldn’t help himself, or he will give you some [other] explanation. And through this [by fulfilling the *mitzvah* of *tochacha*], you will come to realize that he never did something improper to you.

[And in doing so] **“You shall not sin because of him”** – for having baseless hatred towards him.

רבי יוסף בכור שור, ויקרא יט:יז

לֹא־תִשְׂנֵא אֶת־אָחִיךָ בְּלִבְבְּךָ - שֶׁאִם עָשָׂה לְךָ אַחִיךָ דָּבָר שֶׁקָּשָׁה בְּעֵינֶיךָ לֹא תִשְׂנֵאנוּ בְּתוֹךְ לִבְבְּךָ.

אֲלֵא הוֹכִיחֵנוּ, וְאָמַר לוֹ "לִמָּה עָשִׂיתָ לִי כִזָּאת?" שֶׁמֵּא לֹא נִתְכוּוֹן לְמָה שֶׁאַתָּה סָבוּר אוֹ נֶאֱנָס אוֹ שׁוֹם טַעַם יֵשׁ בְּדַבַּר שִׁיאֵמַר לְךָ, וּמִתּוֹךְ כֵּךְ תִּדְעַ שֶׁלֹּא עָשָׂה עִמָּךְ שֶׁלֹּא כִּהוֹגֵן.

וְלֹא־תִשָּׂא עָלָיו חֲטָא - לְשִׁנְאוֹתָנוּ בַּחֲנָם.