

**Cry the Beloved People**  
**Ki Tisa – 2012**

**1. Shmot 32:17-18**

Joshua hears the sound of the people בְּרָעָה, and he said to Moses, “It sounds as though there is a battle going on in the camp!” “It is not the sound of עֲנֹת of victory,” replied [Moses], “nor the sound of עֲנֹת of defeat. What I hear is עֲנֹת .”	וַיִּשְׁמַע יְהוֹשֻׁעַ אֶת-קוֹל הָעָם, בְּרָעָה; וַיֹּאמֶר, אֶל-מֹשֶׁה, קוֹל מִלְחָמָה, בְּמַחֲנֶה. וַיֹּאמֶר, אֵין קוֹל עֲנֹת גְּבוּרָה, וְאֵין קוֹל, חֲלוּשָׁה; קוֹל עֲנֹת, אֲנִי שׁוֹמֵעַ.
---	---

**2. Jerusalem Talmud Ta’anit 4:5**

Moses said: How can it be that a man who in the future will rule over 600,000 doesn’t know how to distinguish between sounds?	אמר משה אדם שהוא עתיד להנהיג שררה על ששים ריבוא אינו יודע להבחין בין קול לקול
---	---

**Scenario One**

**3. Rashi Shmot 32:17**

In their shouting, for they were shouting, rejoicing, and laughing	בהריעו, שהיו מריעים ושמחים וצוחקים
--	------------------------------------

**4. Rashi Shmot 32:18**

This voice does not appear to be a voice of the shouting of heroes crying “Victory!” or the voice of the weak crying “Woe!” or “Flee!” A voice of blasphemy and reviling, which מְעִיֵן the soul of the one who hears them when they are said to him.	אין הקול הזה נראה קול עניית גבורים הצועקים נצחון ולא קול חלשים שצועקים וי או ניסה קול חרופין וגדופין המענין את נפש שומען כשנאמרין לו:
---	---

**Scenario Two**

**5. Shmot 15:21**

Miriam chanted for them, “Sing to G-d for His great victory, horse and rider He cast in the sea.	וַתַּעַן לָהֶם, מִרְיָם: שִׁירוּ לַיהוָה כִּי-גָאֵה גָאֵה, סוּס וְרֹכֵב רָמָה בַיָּם.
--	---

**6. Jerusalem Talmud Ta’anit 4:5**

R. Yasa said: I hear the sound of praise of idolatry.	א"ר יסא קול קילוס עכו"ם אנכי שומע.
---	------------------------------------

## Scenario Three

### 7. Ramban Shmot 32:18

Moses in his great humility did not tell Joshua the cause of the noise, as he did not want to speak of the disgrace of Israel, and so instead he told him it was a noise of merriment.	משה בענותנותו הגדולה לא הגיד הענין ליהושע, כי לא רצה לספר בגנותן של ישראל, אבל אמר לו כי קול שחוק הוא:
--	--

### 8. Translations

Alter – Not the sound of the song of prevailing, nor the sound of the song of failing, sound of choral-song is what I hear.

AV – It is not the voice of them that shout for mastery, neither is it the voice of them that cry for being overcome, but the noise of them that sing do I hear.

Fox – Not the sound of crying out in triumph, and not the sound of crying out in defeat. A sound of crying out I hear.

Hirsch – It is not a voice that announces a victory, nor sound that announces a defeat; a voice that strikes us down do I hear.

JPS – But he answered “It is not the song of the tune of triumph or the sound of the tune of defeat. It is the sound of song that I hear!”

Kaplan – It is not the song of victory, replied Moses, nor the dirge of the defeated. What I hear is just plain singing.