

Can Zionists and anti-Zionists Share the Same Tent? Should They?

Rabbi Zvi Hirschfield & Rabba Shani Gross
Mahloket Matters Mini-Series: Israel Issues
תשפ"ד - Summer 5784

Part I: Defining What Connects Us

1. Rambam (1135–1204), Commentary on the Mishnah: Intro to Ch. 10 Tractate Sanhedrin

And when a person believes in all of these principles and his faith in them is clarified, he enters into the category of Israel; and it is [then] a commandment to love him and to have mercy upon him and to act with him according to everything which God, may He be blessed, commanded about a man towards his fellow, regarding love and brotherhood. And even if he does what is in his ability from the sins, because of desire and the overpowering of his base nature, he is punished according to his sins, but he [still] has a share in the world to come, and is [only considered to be] from the sinners of Israel.

But if one of these principles becomes compromised for a person, behold, he exits the category of Israel and denies a fundamental [dogma] and is called an apostate, a heretic and 'someone who cuts the plantings.' And it is a commandment to hate him and to destroy him, and about him it is stated (Psalms 139:21), "Do I not hate those that You hate, O Lord."

וכאשר יאמין האדם אלה היסודות
כלם ונתברר בה אמונתו בהם, הוא
נכנס בכלל ישראל. ומצוה לאהבו
ולרחם עליו ולנהוג עמו בכל מה
שצוה הש"י איש לחבירו מן
האהבה והאחווה ואפי" עשה מה
שיכול מן העבירות מחמת התאוה
והתגברות הטבע הגרוע, הוא
נענש כפי חטאיו אבל יש לו חלק
לעוה"ב והוא מפושעי ישראל.

וכשנתקלקל לאדם יסוד מאלה
היסודות הרי יצא מן הכלל וכפר
בעיקר ונקרא מין ואפיקורוס וקוצץ
בנטיעות ומצוה לשונאו ולאבדו
ועליו נאמר (תהלים' קל"ט) הלא
משנאך ה' אשנא.

2. Prof. Yeshayahu Leibowitz (1903–1994), "The Uniqueness of the Jewish People"

The Jewish people, as it existed in history, is definable only by relevance to its Judaism - a Judaism that was not a mere idea in the mind but the realization of a program of living set forth in the Torah and delineated by its *Mitzvoth* (commandments). This way of life constituted the specific national content of Jewishness, or in other words, the uniqueness of the Jewish people. The Jew practiced a way of living that was exclusively his. His style of eating was not that of the Gentile - the Jewish kitchen differed from that of all other people... Unlike the identities of the peoples that are characterized by race, language, territory, or state, the national identity of the historic Jewish people



as Judaism, the actuality of which is life according to the Torah. It is not surprising that a people distinguished by a criterion absent from the defining characteristics of all other peoples should also have a history which was different from that of other nations...

3. R' Joseph B. Soloveitchik (1903–1993), “The Covenants of Sinai and Egypt”, Kol Dodi Dofek

What is the Covenant of Fate?... Jewish separateness belongs to the framework of the Covenant of Fate that was concluded in Egypt. In truth, Judaism and withdrawal from the world are synonymous. Even before the exile in Egypt, separateness descended upon our world with the appearance of the first Jew, our father Abraham...

The Covenant of Fate is also expressed in positive categories that stem from the awareness of shared fate. There are four facets to this rare state of mind.

First, the awareness of shared fate appears as that of shared experience. We are all in the realm of a shared fate that binds together the different strata of the nation and does not discriminate between classes and individuals. Fate does not distinguish between nobility and commonfolk, between rich and poor, between a prince dressed in royal purple velvet and a poor man who goes begging from door to door, between a pious Jew and an assimilationist. Even though we may speak a mix of different languages, even if we are citizens of different lands, even if we look different (one being short and black, the other tall and blond), even if we live in different economic systems and under different living conditions (the one living in a royal palace, the other in a humble cave), we have but one fate.

4. R' Judah Halevi (1075–1141), Kuzari 1:95

95. The Rabbi: Bear with me a little while that I show the lofty station of the people. For me it is sufficient that God chose them as His people from all nations of the world, and allowed His influence to rest on all of them, and that they nearly approached being addressed by Him...

If disobedient men existed among them, they were hated, but remained, without doubt, of the essence inasmuch as they were part of it on account of their descent and nature, and begat children who were of the same stamp..

צה) אָמַר הַחֲבֵר: הֲרִפָּה לִי מֵעַט, עַד שְׂאֵבֶאֱר אֶצְלָךְ גְּדֻלַּת הָעָם, וְיָדִי לִי לַעֲד, שֶׁהַשֵּׁם בְּחֵרָם לָעַם וְלֹאֲמָה מִבֵּין אַמּוֹת הָעוֹלָם, וְחֹל הָעֲנִיָּן הָאֱלֹהִי עַל הַמוֹכֵם עַד שֶׁהִגִּיעוּ כָּלֵם אֶל מַעֲלַת הַדְּבָר...

וְאִם הָיוּ בִּינֵיהֶם מַמְרִים הָיוּ נִנְעָלִים, אֲךָ הֵם בְּלִי סִפְקֵי סִגְלָה, כִּאֲשֶׁר הֵם בְּתוֹלְדָתָם וְטִבְעָם מִן הַסִּגְלָה וְיִלְיָדוּ מִי שֶׁהִיא סִגְלָה...



Part II: Are There Limits to our Connection?

Side A

5. Avot D'Rabbi Natan, Version Aleph Chapter 16:4

Hatred of Others. How so? This teaches that a person should not say: Love the sages, but hate the scholars; or: Love the scholars, but hate the common people. Rather, love all of them, but hate the heretics, the enticers, the bad influences, and the traitors. So, too, did David say (Psalms 139:21–22), "I will hate those who hate You, O Lord, and I will despise those who rise up against You. With the utmost hatred I will hate them. They will become my enemies." But it also says (Leviticus 19:18), "[You shall not take vengeance or bear a grudge against members of your people.] You shall love your neighbor as yourself; I am the Eternal." [What is the reason? Because I] created him. So if he behaves as your people you should love him. And if not, you should not love him.

שנאת הבריות כיצד מלמד שלא יכוין אדם לומר אהוב את החכמים ושנוא את התלמידים אהוב את התלמידים ושנוא את עמי הארץ [אלא אהוב את כולם] ושנוא את האפיקורסין והמסיתים ומדיחין וכן המסורות וכן דוד אמר (תהילים קל"ט:כ"א-כ"ב) משנאיך ה' אשנא ובתקוממיך אתקוטט תכלית שנאה שנאתים לאויבים היו לי הלא הוא אומר (ויקרא י"ט:י"ח) ואהבת לרעך כמוך אני ה' [מה טעם כי אני] בראתינו ואם עושה מעשה עמך אתה אוהבו ואם לאו אי אתה אוהבו.

6. Rambam, Mishneh Torah: Laws of the Sanhedrin 11:1

For cruelty to those who sway the people after emptiness brings mercy to the world, as implied by Deuteronomy 13:19: "so that God will turn away from His fierce anger and grant you mercy."

שהאכזריות על אלו שמטעין את העם אחרים ההקבל רחמים הוא בעולם שנאמר (דברים יג יח) "למען ישוב ה' מחרון אפו ונתן לך רחמים":

7. Rambam, Introduction to Avot, Chapter 5

...for to express contempt for those who are loaded with vice, or to depict their deeds as contemptible if done for the purpose of disparaging them in the eyes of other men who may avoid them, and not do as they do is indeed a virtuous duty. Does not Scripture say, (Leviticus 18:3) "After the doings of the land of Egypt ye shall not do, and after the doings of the land of Canaan"? Also, the story of the Sodomites and all the passages occurring in Scripture, which censure those laden with vice, and represent their doings as disgraceful, and those passages which

כי קללת בעלי החסרונות וזכרם לגנות אם יהיה הכוונה בו לחסרם אצל בני אדם עד שיתרחקו מהם ולא יעשו כמעשיהם הוא מחויב והיא מעלה, הלא תראה אמרו ית' כמעשה ארץ מצרים וגו' וכמעשה ארץ כנען, וספרו הסדומיים וכל מה שבא במקרא מגנות בעלי החסרונות וזכרם לגנאי ושבח הטובים והגדלתם אין הכוונה בו רק



<p>praise and hold the good in high esteem, endeavor, as I have said, to induce man to follow the paths of the righteous, and to shun the way of the wicked.</p>	<p>מה שזכרתי לך עד שימשכו בני אדם אחרי דרך הטובים האלה, ויתרחקו מדרך הרעים ההם.</p>
--	---

Side B

8. Tractate Kiddushin 20b

<p>As the school of Rabbi Yishmael taught: Since this person who sold himself as a slave has gone and become a priest for idol worship, one might say: Let us throw a stone after the fallen. Therefore, the verse states: "After he is sold he shall be redeemed; one of his brothers may redeem him" (Leviticus 25:48).</p>	<p>דַּתְנִי דְבֵי רַבִּי יִשְׁמַעֵאל: הוֹאִיל וְהֵלֵךְ זֶה וְנַעֲשֶׂה כּוֹמֵר לְעַבֹּדָה זָרָה, אֵימָא: לִידְחֵי אֶבֶן אַחַר הַנוֹפֵל – תִּלְמוּד לומר: "אַחֲרַי נִמְכַר בְּאֵלֶּה תִּהְיֶה לוֹ אֶחָד מֵאֲחָיו וַיִּגְאֹלנוּ".</p>
---	--

9. R' Shneur Zalman of Liadi (1745–1812), Tanya, Chapter 32

<p>Furthermore, they are actually all equal, they all have one father. It is on account of this common root in the One G-d that all of Israel are called "brothers"—in the full sense of the word, only the bodies are distinct from each other. Therefore, there can be no true love and fraternity between those who regard their bodies as primary and their souls secondary but only a love based on an external factor.</p> <p>This means that even in the case of those who are removed from G-d's Torah and His service and are therefore classified simply as "creatures," one must attract them with strong cords of love, perhaps one might succeed in drawing them near to the Torah and Divine service. Even if one fails, one has not forfeited the merit of the mitzvah of neighborly love.</p>	<p>בְּשֵׁנִם שְׂכוּלֵן מִתְאִימוֹת, וְאֵב אֶחָד לְכוֹלְנָה, וְלֹכֵן נִקְרְאוּ כָּל יִשְׂרָאֵל "אֲחִים" מִמֶּשׁ, מִצַּד שׁוֹרֵשׁ נִפְשָׁם בְּהִי אֶחָד רַק שְׁהַגּוֹפִים מְחולְקִים. וְלֹכֵן, הַעוֹשִׂים גּוֹפִם עֵיקָר וְנִפְשָׁם טְפִלָּה – אִי אֶפְשֶׁר לְהִיּוֹת אֶהְבָּה וְאַחֻוּהַ אֲמִיתִית בֵּינֵיהֶם, אֲלֵא הַתְּלוּיָהּ בְּדַבָּר לְבַדָּה...</p> <p>לומר, שְׂאֵף הַרְחוּקִים מִתּוֹרַת הִי וְעַבֹּדוֹתָהּ, וְלֹכֵן נִקְרְאִים בְּשֵׁם "בְּרִיּוֹת" בְּעֵלְמָא – צָרִיךְ לְמַשְׁכֵּן בְּחַבְלֵי עֲבוֹתוֹת אֶהְבָּה, וְכוּלֵי הָאִי וְאוּלֵי יוֹכֵל לְקַרְבֵּן לְתוֹרָה וְעַבֹּדוֹת הִי; וְהֵן לֹא – לֹא הַפְסִיד שְׂכָר מִצְוֹת אֶהְבַּת רֵיעִים.</p>
---	--

10. R' Kook (1865–1935), Shmoneh Kevatzim 1: 733

<p>When associating oneself with lesser souls, such as those who violate norms or evil people there comes harm. But if they possess some kind of good quality, and the intention for the connection is only towards the good aspects, if his strength is strong then it brings elevation [to this soul]. And</p>	<p>כִּשְׂמִתְחַבְּרִים עִם נַפְשוֹת פְּחוּתוֹת שֶׁל פּוֹרְצִים וְרָשָׁעִים, נִפְגָּמִים. אֲבֵל אִם יֵשׁ בָּהֶם אִיזָה דָבָר טוֹב, וּמִתְכוּוֹנִים בַּהֲתַחַבְּרוֹת רַק אֵל הַצַּד שֶׁל הַטּוֹב, אִז אִם כְּחוֹ יִפֶּה הִרִי זֶה מִתְעַלָּה. וְאִפִּילוּ</p>
--	---



even though looking into evil faces is prohibited, if those countenances contain aspects of goodness wherein intention focuses solely towards absorbing them, then this is also a pathway of mitzvah.

ההסתכלות בפני אדם רשע שאסורה, אם יש בו צדדים של טוב, ומתכוין בהסתכלות רק לקלוט את הטוב, נראה שיש בזה דרך של מצוה.